



New Jersey Agricultural  
Experiment Station

# History and Overview of Direct to Consumer Delivery Guidance

Donald W Schaffner, PhD

Distinguished Professor and Extension  
Specialist

# Outline

- USDA Grant
  - Godwin and Hallman: Identifying Food Safety Risk Factors and Educational Strategies for Consumers Purchasing Seafood and Meat Products Online supported by the National Institute of Food and Agriculture, U.S. Department of Agriculture, under Agreement No. 2011-38821-31107.
- CFP 2016-2018
  - Review of the charge and the report
- CFP 2018-2020
  - Review of the charge, committee and report

## CFP 2016-2018

- Mail Order Food Safety Committee (Issue 2016 III-037) was created to:
  - Identify **best practices** and **existing guidance documents** related to **shipment of perishable food items directly to a consumer**.
  - Develop a guidance document for food establishments that includes **best practices for transportation of perishable food items** directly to a consumer to include **proper packaging; temperature control** during shipping, receiving, and storage; **return of compromised and abused products**; and **other** food safety related topics.
  - Share results...

# 2016-2018 committee and report

Prepared by the  
Mail Order Foods Committee  
2016-2018 Conference for Food Protection

Christine Applewhite, Chair  
Christina Bongo-Box, Vice-Chair

**Committee members:**

Anthony Auffray  
Mitzi Baum  
Blanca Caballero  
Andrew Harris  
Deborah Marlow  
Jennifer Reyes  
Don Schaffner  
Ellen Thomas  
Lisa Weddig  
Kelli Whiting  
John Zimmermann

**Federal consultants and alternates:**

Melanie Abley  
Kristina Barlow  
Mary Cartagena  
Evelyne Mbandi  
Jessica Otto

**At-large, non-voting members:**

Ashley Hallowell  
Aimee Lee  
Clyde Manuel  
Mark Moretz  
Alli Pearson

**Council III chair and vice-chair:**

Davene Sarrocco-Smith  
Keith Jackson

## *Table of Contents*

Preface.....	4
Part 1. Introduction .....	5
Part 2. Definitions .....	5
Part 3. Scope .....	7
Part 4. Temperature control and use by dates .....	7
Regulatory requirements .....	7
Temperature control requirements for food safety .....	10
Advice on good practice .....	12
Procedures for taking food temperatures .....	12
The application of a use by date .....	14
Part 5. Packaging and mailing to the consumer .....	15
Package sanitation and integrity .....	15
Packaging system once product is wrapped .....	15
Refrigerant/coolant in the package .....	15
Dunnage .....	16
Destination details.....	17
Labeling of transit packaging.....	17
General packaging information.....	17
Choice of carrier and service level.....	18
Signature release .....	18
Consumer concerns.....	18
Handling returned packaging.....	19
Part 6. Training .....	19
General principles regarding training .....	19
Supervision and instruction and/or training of food handlers.....	20
Training in the application of HACCP principles.....	21
Part 7. Appendices .....	23
Appendix A: Food regulation overview, labeling and recalls .....	23
Appendix B: Trading standards and imported food issues .....	27

## CFP 2018-2020

- Direct to Consumer Delivery Committee
  - Identify current recommended practices and existing guidance documents that relate to shipment directly to a consumer of perishable food items **and for the safe delivery of food by Third Party Delivery Services (TPDS)** entities.
  - Revise the Guidance Document for Mail Order Food Companies that includes recommended practices for transportation directly to a consumer of perishable products, to include **proper packaging; temperature control** during shipping, receiving, and storage; **return of compromised and abused products**; and **other** food safety related topics. Current guidance document to be revised to include **food safety training for the TPDS entities**, and information on **all food delivery practices** from food production, distribution, or retail food service facilities.
  - Share results...

## Related charges

- AFDO
  - Develop guidance on regulation of Direct to Consumer online ordering establishments such as Amazon
- GFSI ecommerce TWG
  - Define the risks and define best practices to mitigate them
  - Identify roles and responsibilities between the public and private sector: role of vendors, manufacturers, regulators, delivery
  - Identify gaps in the system
  - Identify and map references from the relevant recognized industry standards / initiatives, best practices from the private sector and existing regulatory practices
  - Look for opportunities for alignment between government and GFSI
  - Identify gaps and opportunities for further review beyond the current scope

## 2018-2020 committee

- 18 voting committee members
- 25 at large non-voting
- 8 more federal consultants, CFP Council III chair and vice, AFDO, etc.
- Volunteers from
  - Amazon
  - Blue Apron
  - Uber Eats
  - Jet.com
  - Foodwit

Committee Name: Direct to Consumer Delivery Committee 18 Voting Members 45 Total Members (7Industry:7Regulatory:2Academia:1Consumer)				
Last Name	First Name	Position (Chair/Member)	Constituency	Employer
Schaffner	Don	CHAIR	Academia	Rutgers University
Espinoza	Albert	VICE CHAIR	Industry -Retail	HEB
Auffray	Anthony	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Amazon
Beyer	Nancy	Voting Member	Regulator - State	MO Dept of HSS
Bongo-Box	Christina	Voting Member	Industry - Service	Little Caesars Enterprises, Inc
Brown	Robert	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Whole Foods
Duffy	Liz	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Walmart
Friel	Caroline	Voting member	Industry -Retail	Wawa Inc
Graham	Joe	Voting Member	Regulator - State	WA State Department of Health
LaFleur	Rosalind	Voting Member	Regulator - Local	Houston Health Department
Madamba	Valerie	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Blue Apron, LLC
Millwood	Corey	Voting Member	Regulator - State	GA Dept. of Public Health
Navin	Joseph	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Uber Eats
Patton	Travis	Voting Member	Regulator - State	Kentucky Department for Public Health
Rogers	Jim	Voting Member	Consumer	Consumer Reports
Sheehan	Brandy	Voting Member	Regulator - Local	Jefferson County Health Department
Stratman	Robert	Voting Member	Regulator - Local	Maricopa County Environmental Services
Yang	Lily	Voting Member	Academia	Virginia Tech
Ams	Christina	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Jet.com
Arbizu	Thomas	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	HEB
Clark	Jeffrey	At-Large Non-Voting	Student	University of Arkansas
Collins	Alicia	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	The Steritech Group, Inc.
Friedlander	Adam	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	FMI
Heil	Kathryn	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	AboveTraining Inc.
Hernandez	Cris	At-Large Non-Voting	Regulator - Local	Washington County-Oregon
Holmes	Becki	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Foodwit
Humphries	Sharon	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Bojangles' Restaurants, Inc.
Kantrowitz	Sarah	At-Large Non-Voting	Academia	Harvard Graduate School of Design
Khatib	Nidal	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	KFC
Lee	Aimee	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Publix Super Market
Linton	Andrew	At-Large Non-Voting	Regulator - Local	Maricopa County Environmental Services
Luczynski	Michael	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Processing	Boar's Head Provisions Co., Inc.
Marra	Paul	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Wegmans Food Markets
Mikeska	B. J.	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Diversey
Miller	Ashley	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	National Restaurant Association
Money	Elaine	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Ecolab
Moore	Eric	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Testo Solutions N.A.
O'Donnell	James	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Husmann Corp
Patel	Jaymin	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Hardees / Carls Jr.
Thomas	Ellen	At-Large Non-Voting	Academia	RTI International
Vinson	Scott	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	National Retail Federation
Zaziski	Linda	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Little Caesar Enterprises, Inc
Zetlau	Jessica	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	YUM! Brands
Mers	Todd	Observer	Regulator - State	Ohio Department of Agriculture
Wanucha	Donna	FDA alternate	FDA	FDA
Otto	Jessica	FDA	FDA	FDA
Hammons	Susan	USDA	USDA	USDA
Abley	Melanie	USDA alternate	USDA	USDA
Jackson	Keith	CFP Council III chair		
Applewhite	Christine	CFP Council III vice chair		
Colson	Matt	At-Large Non-Voting	AFDO rep	Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services



# Voting membership

Committee Name: Direct to Consumer Delivery Committee

Last Name	First Name	Position (Chair/Member)	Constituency	Employer
Schaffner	Don	Chair	Academia	Rutgers University
Espinoza	Albert	Vice chair	Industry -Retail	HEB
Auffray	Anthony	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Amazon
Beyer	Nancy	Voting Member	Regulator - State	MO Dept of HSS
Bongo-Box	Christina	Voting Member	Industry - Service	Little Caesars Enterprises, Inc
Brown	Robert	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Whole Foods
Feeney	Catherine	Voting Member	Regulator - State	Rhode Island Department of Health
Friel	Caroline	Voting member	Industry -Retail	Wawa Inc
Graham	Joe	Voting Member	Regulator - State	WA State Department of Health
Hernandez	Cris	Voting Member	Regulator - Local	Washington County-Oregon
LaFleur	Rosalind	Voting Member	Regulator - Local	Houston Health Department
Madamba	Valerie	Voting Member	Industry -Retail	Blue Apron, LLC
Millwood	Corey	Voting Member	Regulator - State	GA Dept. of Public Health
Navin	Joseph	Voting Member	Industry - Service	Uber Eats
Patton	Travis	Voting Member	Regulator - State	Kentucky Department for Public Health
Rogers	Jim	Voting Member	Consumer	Consumer Reports
Yang	Lily	Voting Member	Academia	Virginia Tech
Zetlau	Jessica	Voting member	Industry - Service	YUM! Brands



# Non-voting Membership

Ams	Christina	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Jet.com
Arbizu	Thomas	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	HEB
Ball	Joshua	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Ecolab
Bleckner	Callie	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Instacart
Clark	Jeffrey	At-Large Non-Voting	Student	University of Arkansas
Collins	Alicia	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	The Steritech Group, Inc.
Cox-Horton	Michelle	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Peapod
Duffy	Liz	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Walmart
Friedlander	Adam	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	FMI
Heil	Kathryn	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	AboveTraining Inc.
Holmes	Becki	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Foodwit
Humphries	Sharon	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Bojangles' Restaurants, Inc.
Kantrowitz	Sarah	At-Large Non-Voting	Academia	Harvard Graduate School of Design
Khatib	Nidal	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	KFC
Lee	Aimee	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Publix Super Market
Luczynski	Michael	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Processing	Boar's Head Provisions Co., Inc.
Marra	Paul	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Wegmans Food Markets
Mikeska	B. J.	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Diversey
Miller	Ashley	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	National Restaurant Association
Money	Elaine	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Ecolab
Moore	Eric	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Testo Solutions N.A.
O'Donnell	James	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	Hussmann Corp
Patel	Jaymin	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Hardees / Carls Jr.
Sheehan	Brandy	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Retail	Schnuck Markets, Inc.
Thomas	Ellen	At-Large Non-Voting	Academia	RTI International
Vinson	Scott	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Support	National Retail Federation
Wijsekera	Dikshika	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Instacart
Zaziski	Linda	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	Little Caesar Enterprises, Inc
Zetlau	Jessica	At-Large Non-Voting	Industry - Service	YUM! Brands
Mers	Todd	Observer	Regulator - State	Ohio Department of Agriculture
Wanucha	Donna	FDA alternate	FDA	FDA
Otto	Jessica	FDA	FDA	FDA
Hammons	Susan	USDA	USDA	USDA
Abley	Melanie	USDA alternate	USDA	USDA
Jackson	Keith	CFP Council III chair		
Applewhite	Christine	CFP Council III vice chair		
Colson	Matt	At-Large Non-Voting	AFDO rep	Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

# Understanding the marketplace

PERISHABLE FOOD DELIVERY: DTC BUSINESS MODELS	OWN INVENTORY	STORE	PACK	LABEL	PROCESS / PREPARE	MANAGE ONLINE ORDERING PLATFORM	DELIVER				COMMENTS
							Employees	Independent Contractors	Third-party courier	Other (e.g., unattended)	
<b>ONLINE/CATALOG RETAILERS</b> Examples: Amazon, Butcher Box, Moink, Omaha Steaks, Strauss Direct	X	X	maybe	maybe	maybe	X	X	X	X	X	* Some of these retailers may also be manufacturers * Marked 'X' for 'other delivery' to capture practices like Amazon's in-car delivery; this may become more prevalent for other business models too
<b>ONLINE GROCERY</b> Examples: Amazon Fresh, Fresh Direct, Peapod, Thrive Market, Walmart Grocery/Jet.com	X	X	maybe	maybe	maybe	X	X	X	X	-	
<b>RESTAURANTS</b> Examples: Domino's	X	X	X	X	X	maybe	X	X	X	-	* Some restaurants could deliver food by third-party courier, e.g., a restaurant fulfilling a long-distance order placed via Goldbelly may be responsible for arranging shipment
<b>MEAL OR OTHER KITS</b> Examples: Blue Apron, Daily Harvest, Green Chef/Hell Fresh, Greenblender, Home Chef, Hungryroot, Marley Spoon (Martha Stewart), Munchery, Plated, Purple Carrot, Sunbasket, Thistle Baby, Raised Real, Tovola	X	X	X	X	X	X	maybe	X	X	-	* Tovola: ready to cook in oven provided * Raised Real, Thistle Baby: baby / kids' food
<b>RTE MEALS</b> Examples: GO ReadyMade, Kettlebell Kitchen, Munchery, Personal Trainer Food, PureSpoon, Sakara Schwan's, Splendid Spoon, Yumble, ZEN Foods	X	X	X	X	X	X	maybe	X	X	X	* Kettlebell: delivers to homes, offices, gym vending machines * Purespoon, Yumble: baby food / kids' meals
<b>THIRD-PARTY DELIVERY SERVICES</b> Examples: Caviar, Instacart, Doordash, Favor (TX), Foodkick (Fresh Direct - NYC), Postmates, Providence Food Delivery (TN), UberEats	-	-	-	-	-	X	maybe	X	-	-	* Instacart uses both employees and independent contractors, depending on the role
<b>AGGREGATORS</b> Examples: Goldbelly, Grubhub / Seamless	-	-	-	-	-	X	maybe	X	-	-	* Not clear whether Goldbelly plays any part in facilitating shipment

# Another Way of Understanding the Marketplace

Role	Food Safety relevant controls	Risk
0. Registered owner of the business	Controls overall business plan and possibly delegates parts of the service/execution, Handles all other issues not otherwise specified	Lack of assessment of business partners Lack of detail in contractual service agreement Lack of verification that food safety program is effective (e.g. chill chain)
1. Controls web interface with customer	Enables product/transaction info that can made available to customer Enables delivery information available to customer	Lack of information (incl. allergens) Unclear expectation (incl. chill chain)
2. Sets product/SKU in website	Provides product information used by the customer to make purchase decision	Erroneous information (allergens) Erroneous claim (e.g. cures cancer)
3. Owns/set organization of last mile delivery	Validate chill chain based on weather, time, packaging and load - worst case scenario Selects last mile delivery execution company/people	Chill chain not designed to prevent bacteria growth in worst case conditions (farthest hottest) Delivery execution not set to execute SOP (not qualified, not briefed)
4. Makes/Modifies/Stores food at order time (usually regulated)	Receive, modify (crisp, portion, assemble), cold store for long period	Accepts chilled food out of temp Cross-contaminate produce during handling/process operations Product temp pre-delivery over chill chain validation assumption
5. Owns inventory	Execute product procurement as contractually agreed Maintain traceability	Product is materially different from specs (non-dairy dish ordered, dairy dish provided) Products not linked to relevant recall (source product from non-approved business/facility)
6. Executes last mile	Follow clearly established delivery SOP but owns execution	Deviates from validated chill chain (disregard delivery window) Induce unplanned contamination, damages (pets, smokes in vehicle)

Amazon Fresh fit all the roles; Amazon Restaurant is 0, 1, 3; Amazon.com/Merchant Fulfillment Network is 0,1; Amazon.com/Fulfilled By Amazon is 0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 but not 6.

Instacart and Uber Eats are probably 0, 1, 3

Pea Pod, Hello Fresh and Fresh Direct are likely like A. Fresh 0,1,2,3,4,5,6

Omaha Steak is likely 0,1,2,3,4,5 for its owned business but also contributes as 2,3,4,5 when operating on Amazon

Many brick and mortar retailers are 2, 4, 5 working with Instacart, Uber Eats or Amazon Prime Now

Teisseire selling Teisseire Grenadine syrup on Amazon is 2, 5

"French My World" selling Teisseire Grenadine syrup on Amazon is 3, 4, 5

## *Table of Contents*

1. Preface .....	5
2. Introduction and Scope .....	6
3. Definitions .....	7
4. Foundational concepts .....	11
A. Regulatory Requirements .....	11
B. Risk Management Overview .....	11
5. Direct to Consumer guidance .....	14
A. Considerations Prior to Delivery .....	14
B. Temperature Control During Transportation and Delivery .....	14
C. Choosing Packaging .....	16
D. Preventing Contamination .....	18
E. Other Delivery Considerations .....	18
F. Food Safety Training .....	19
G. Consumer Communication .....	20
H. Best Practices for Managing a DTC Delivery Food Safety Program .....	21
6. Third-Party Delivery guidance .....	26
A. Food Safety Responsibilities .....	26
B. Preventing Contamination .....	26
C. Food Safety Education and Training .....	28
D. Management of Non-Compliance .....	30
E. Other Food Safety Considerations .....	30
7. Appendices .....	32
A. Food regulation overview, labeling, and recalls .....	32
B. Other resources .....	37
C. Trading standards and imported food issues .....	40

• 4 = 3 pg

• 5 = 12 pg

• 6 = 6 pg

• 7 = 8 pg

## Section 1-4

- + **1. Preface**
- + **2. Introduction and Scope**
- + **3. Definitions**
- + **4. Foundational concepts**
  - + **A. Regulatory Requirements**
  - + **B. Risk Management Overview**
    - + **Identifying, assessing, and controlling risk in DTC or TPD foods**
    - + **Validation and verification**
    - + **Risk Management Resources**

# Definitions

- Active Managerial Control
- Best Practices
- Broker
- Common Carrier
- Coolant
- Direct to Consumer (DTC) Food Delivery
- Direct to Consumer (DTC) Food Delivery Company
- Feed
- First in First out (FIFO)
- Food Deliverer
- Food Employee/Handler
- Food Establishment
- Food for Home Preparation
- Food for Immediate Consumption
- Food for Later Consumption
- Food Ordering Platform
- Food Safety Plan
- Food Shopper
- Food
- HACCP
- Hazard
- Mechanical Refrigeration
- Monitoring
- Passive Refrigeration
- Pathogen
- Perishable Foods
- Preventive Controls
- Provisioning System
- Ready-to-Eat (RTE)
- Records
- Regulatory Authority
- Risk Control Plan
- Risk
- Shippers
- Slacking
- Staging
- Standard Operating Procedures (SOP)
- Third-Party Delivery Service
- Time/Temperature Control for Safety (TCS) Food
- Validate
- Verify

## Section 5

- ✦ ***5. Direct to Consumer guidance***
  - ✦ **A. Considerations Prior to Delivery**
  - ✦ **B. Temperature Control During Transportation and Delivery**
    - ✦ Conducting temperature-control validation
  - ✦ **C. Choosing Packaging**
    - ✦ Outer packaging
    - ✦ Coolants
    - ✦ Dunnage
  - ✦ **D. Preventing Contamination**
  - ✦ **E. Other Delivery Considerations**
  - ✦ **F. Food Safety Training**
    - ✦ General principles
    - ✦ Conducting training
  - ✦ **G. Consumer Communication**
    - ✦ Product information
    - ✦ Instructions for consumer feedback and concerns
  - ✦ **H. Best Practices for Managing a DTC Delivery Food Safety Program**
    - ✦ Responsibilities for implementing food-safety control
    - ✦ Monitoring
      - ✦ Developing a Monitoring Approach
    - ✦ Managing noncompliance and continuous improvement
    - ✦ Traceability and recalls
    - ✦ Corrective and Preventive Action Plans



## Section 6

- + **6. *Third-Party Delivery guidance***
  - + **A. Food Safety Responsibilities**
  - + **B. Preventing Contamination**
    - + Time/Temperature Control
    - + Temperature Monitoring for Staging Foods at Food Establishments
    - + Packaging
    - + Food Tampering
    - + Delivery Bag Usage, Maintenance, and Cleanliness
    - + Vehicle Cleanliness and Inspections
  - + **C. Food Safety Education and Training**
    - + Education and Training Topics
      - + Contamination
      - + Temperature Control
      - + Personal Health
      - + Personal Hygiene
  - + **D. Management of Non-Compliance**
  - + **E. Other Food Safety Considerations**
    - + Food Allergens
    - + Traceability and recalls
    - + Technology and Innovation

## Section 7

### + **7. Appendices**

#### + **A. Food regulation overview, labeling, and recalls**

- + **Regulatory overview**

- + **Food laws**

- + **Food regulations**

- + **Labeling**

- + **Traceability and recalls for direct to consumer and third-party delivery services parties**

- + **FDA recalls**

- + **USDA FSIS recalls**

#### + **B. Other resources**

- + **Relevant resources regarding temperature control**

- + **Relevant resources regarding pathogen growth risk**

- + **Procedures for taking food temperatures**

#### + **C. Trading standards and imported food issues**

# Thanks for listening

- CFP issue page
  - [http://www.foodprotect.org/issues/packets/2020Packet/III\\_004.html](http://www.foodprotect.org/issues/packets/2020Packet/III_004.html)
- Report PDF
  - [http://www.foodprotect.org/issues/packets/2020Packet/attachments/III\\_004\\_content\\_c.pdf](http://www.foodprotect.org/issues/packets/2020Packet/attachments/III_004_content_c.pdf)



# Questions?

